Church and State in Modern Latin America

HIS 346W (85285); LAS F366 (85805)

Instructor: Dr. Matthew Butler

Semester: SUMMER 2013
Time: MTWThF 1:00-2:30 p.m. (2:15 p.m.)
Venue: GAR 1.126
Prerequisite: Upper Division Standing

Office: Garrison 3.414
Office hours: TH 2:30-4:30 p.m.
Phone: 512-475-7972
Email: mbutler@austin.utexas.edu

Description

This course traces the history of the politics of religion, and of the religion of politics, in modern Latin America. Throughout, special emphasis is placed on the history of the Roman Catholic Church in the region. Within these basic parameters, the course is both thematic and chronological in its organization.

Chronologically, the course covers begins with a brief survey of the colonial period and then gives special attention to the national period running from independence (circa 1820) up to the Cuban Revolution (circa 1960), after which both Church and state entered significantly new and distinctive phases (e.g. the emergence of bureaucratic-authoritarian military dictatorships, and of Liberation Theology and Protestantization).

Thematically, special emphasis is placed on the causes of Church-state tension in the aftermath of Latin American independence (Church wealth; allegations of clerical aloofness from the nation; disputes over ecclesiastical patronage); and on the Church’s multifaceted response to the gradual rise of political liberalism (the counter-development of a modern, intransigent Catholic culture; the sponsorship of new devotions; the promotion of “social” Catholicism and Catholic political parties; mobilization of the laity and of women, especially; identification with supportive regimes). We will also consider the character of Latin American anticlericalism in this period; the diplomatic and political relationships linking the Latin American republics (and their national churches) with Rome; and the social and educational influence of the clergy. In the second half of the course, we will begin to emphasize significant national cases (Ecuador, Mexico, Colombia, Argentina, Peru, Guatemala), allowing the course to branch out in a more comparative sense as we proceed.

As the focus on questions of devotion as well as power implies, we will not just be looking at the way in which the Church responded to changing political circumstances after the demise of the colonial regime, but at changes in religious practice and meaning, and how these were experienced by ordinary people.

During the course we will read as a group and make time to see a selection of relevant films.

1. Course Materials

Set texts

Austin Ivereigh (ed.) The Politics of Religion in an Age of Revival (London: ILAS, 2000) (NB: often out of print: required chapters provided on Blackboard)

Schwaller is our up-to-date textbook. The Greene book is a short (classic and readable) novel. Ivereigh is an anthology of essays (excerpts supplied), while Wright Ríos is a case study of 19th and 20th-century Mexico. We will not be reading all the texts systematically, but reading selections in conjunction with several other essays and primary sources. Again, we can be selective in using these so that the reading load is appropriate.

Though it is not prescribed as a set text since it is out of print and ancient, the classic work by John Lloyd Mecham, *Church and State in Latin America: A History of Politico-Ecclesiastical Relations* (1934. Second ed. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1966), is indispensable as a basic work of reference. It is available in the Benson Collection or in electronic version through the UT library catalog (simply find the item and follow the links to the “electronic resource” version).

**Additional set readings (supplied on the Blackboard course page)**


**Source documents (supplied on the Blackboard course page)**


Domingo Sarmiento, *Facundo: Civilization and Barbarism* ([1851], Berkeley: University of California, 2004), pp. 205-227


**Suggested supplementary bibliography**

Kristina Boylan, “Gendering the Faith and Altering the Nation. Mexican Catholic


Christopher Clark, “The New Catholicism and the European Culture Wars,” in Clark, Christopher, & Kaiser, Wolfram (eds), Culture Wars: Secular-Catholic Conflict in Nineteenth-Century Europe (Cambridge: CUP, 2003), 11-46


___., The Church and revolution: Cuba and Nicaragua (La Trove: La Trove University Institute of Latin American Studies, 1983)


Peter Henderson, Gabriel García Moreno and Conservative State Formation in Nineteenth-Century Ecuador (Austin: UT Press, 2008)


Jeffrey Klaiber, “Anticlericalism in the Nineteenth and Early Twentieth Centuries,” in Lee Penyak and Walter Petry (eds.), Religion and Society in Latin America: Interpretive Essays from Conquest to Present (Maryknoll, 2009), 157-174


___, “González Prada’s Anti-Catholic Knee. The Rise of Radical Anticlericalism,” in Jeffrey Klaiber, Religion and Revolution in Peru (Notre Dame” University of Notre Dame Press, 1977), 24-44 (inc. notes, 205-9)


Paul Christopher Manuel; Lawrence Reardon; Clyde Wilcox (eds.), The Catholic Church and the Nation-state: Comparative Perspectives (Georgetown: Georgetown University Press, 2006)

Tomás Eloy Martínez, Santa Evita (NY: Vintage, 1997)


Hubert Miller, “Liberal Modernization and Religious Corporate Property in Nineteenth-Century Guatemala,” in Jackson, Robert H (ed.). Liberals, the Church, and Indian Peasants: Corporate Lands and the Challenge of Reform in 19th-Century Spanish America (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1997), 95-122


Lee M. Penyak and Walter J. Petry (eds.), Religion and Society in Latin America: Interpretive Essays from Conquest to Present (Maryknoll: Orbis Books, 2009)


Douglass Sullivan-González, Piety, Power, and Politics: Religion and Nation
There is a vast historiography in Spanish also, which covers any imaginable aspect of Church-state relations. A good starting point to explore this parallel literature is Jean Meyer, *Historia de los Cristianos en América Latina* (Mexico City, 1989).

Films

We will make time to view a selection of films that have a direct bearing on the religious question in Latin America, which may including some of the following: *Nazarín, Canoa, Yo la peor de todas, “Qué Viva México!, El desierto adentro, El niño Fidencio: el taumaturgo de Espinazo, El Bautizo, For Greater Glory, The Last Supper*

2. Assignments

There is no final exam. Instead there will be weekly (five) writing assignments:

(i) **Short papers** – 4 x 2 pp. double-spaced essays *(DUE FRIDAYS WEEKS 2-5)*

(ii) **Final paper** – 6 pp. double-spaced essay *(DUE THURSDAY WEEK 6)*

There are two tracks for completing the final paper, one following a standard or default essay question (TBA Week 5) and the other based on a topic of your choice agreed with me. Students writing more individualized papers have previously covered topics such as the cult of the Virgin of Guadalupe in Mexico; the Church and its links to the Sandinista revolution in Nicaragua; and the conservative Catholic state pioneered by Gabriel García Moreno in nineteenth-century Ecuador. Substantial bibliographical research is required for both papers. There is no preference or bias in favor of either the standard or individual option, though the latter can often produce more interesting work.

Individual topics for the final paper *must* be agreed with me **TUESDAY WEEK 5**.

Grading policies

(a) **Weighting of assignments.**

Individual assignments will be weighted as part of the total course credit as below:
Reading papers (x 4 @ 15% = collectively 60%) +
Final paper (40%)
= 100%

(b) Grading scale

At the end of the semester, the accumulated % will be converted into a final letter grade for the course. UT (Fall 2009) has now introduced a plus/minus scale for both semester and final course grades. The grading scale in this course takes advantage of this and will be as follows:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>93-100%</td>
<td>A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90-92%</td>
<td>A-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>87-89%</td>
<td>B+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83-86%</td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80-82%</td>
<td>B-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>77-79%</td>
<td>C+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73-76%</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-72%</td>
<td>C-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67-69%</td>
<td>D+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63-66%</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-62%</td>
<td>D-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Below 60%</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To do well in the assignments, you will need to keep pace with the readings; develop your analytical skills (e.g. concerning different interpretations of Latin American history, not just factual recall); develop your compositional skills (by presenting a reasoned, opinionated case on paper); and improve your communication skills (by contributing to discussions). By the end of the course, you will have an understanding of the theoretical and historical problems associated with organized religion in Latin American states and detailed knowledge of specific cases drawn selectively from across the region.

3. Course Format and Provisional Schedule

Mondays will usually be devoted to reviewing the main theme or reading for the week, with a mixture of discussion (based on short question prompts) and additional mini-lectures to supply background material as needed; on Tuesdays and Wednesdays we will explore more thematic topics based around the other, more targeted, weekly readings, either in a lecture or discussion format; Thursdays will usually be devoted to studying one or two source materials (20 pp. max.) as a group; Fridays will be for films and/or consolidation, and will also be the day for submitting assignments.

Below you will find a week-by-week, and day-by-day, breakdown of the course, including each general class topic, the readings for each given day, plus any assignments (in bold). Again, primary documents and supplementary readings will be supplied via Blackboard.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Wk.</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Activity, Readings by Class, Assignments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>THU 6 JUN</td>
<td>Registration</td>
<td>Syllabus and course outline</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FRI 7 JUN</td>
<td>Overview and concepts</td>
<td>Lecture/discussion <em>(Schwaller, pp. 266-275)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>MON 10 JUN</td>
<td>Conquest and the colonial Church</td>
<td>Group discussion <em>(Schwaller, pp. 33-95)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TUE 11 JUN</td>
<td>Late colony to independence</td>
<td>Group discussion <em>(Schwaller, pp. 96-142)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WED 12 JUN</td>
<td>Church patronage under the republic</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>THU 13 JUN</td>
<td>Catholic republics?</td>
<td>Primary source analysis <em>(Calderón de la Barca, Life in Mexico, pp. 128-141, 179-183)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FRI 14 JUN</td>
<td><em>Film</em></td>
<td><em>Yo, la peor de todas</em> or <em>The Last Supper</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Assignment: Paper 1 [Render unto Caesar]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>TUE 18 JUN</td>
<td>Reform &amp; Church-State separation</td>
<td>Lecture <em>(Brading, “Ultramontane Intransigence” in Ivereigh, Politics of Religion, pp. 115-142)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>THU 20 JUN</td>
<td>“Chilean sociability”</td>
<td>Primary source analysis <em>(Bilbao, “Generational Warrior,” pp. 120-126)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FRI 21 JUN</td>
<td><em>Film</em></td>
<td><em>Nazarín</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Assignment: Paper 2 [Anticlericalism]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>MON 24 JUN</td>
<td>The Church reborn? Central America</td>
<td>Lecture/group discussion <em>(Schwaller, pp. 166-188)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>WED 26 JUN</td>
<td>Catholic “revival” in mid-19C. Argentina</td>
<td>Primary source <em>(Sarmiento, Facundo, pp. 205-227)</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>THU 27 JUN</td>
<td>Mexico’s “Catholic”</td>
<td><em>(Wright Ríos, Revolutions in Mexican Catholicism,</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Date</td>
<td>Lecture</td>
<td>Topic</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRI 28 JUN</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>MON 1 JUL</td>
<td>The Church amidst Mexico’s Revolution</td>
<td>Discussion (Wright-Ríos, Revolutions in Mexican Catholicism, pp. 206-241)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TUE 2 JUL</td>
<td>Final paper prompt /revision session</td>
<td>General guidance. NB: I will ask you to indicate at this session to outline any individual option you may choose for your final paper.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THU 4 JUL</td>
<td>4th July holiday!</td>
<td>No class Lecture</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRI 5 JUL</td>
<td>Criistero rebellion inMexico, 1926-1929</td>
<td>Assignment: Paper 4 [review of Greene, Power and the Glory]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>MON 8 JUL</td>
<td>Film</td>
<td>For Greater Glory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TUE 9 JUL</td>
<td>20C. Revolutions &amp; the Church: Perón</td>
<td>Discussion/lecture (Schwaller, pp. 189-230)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WED 10 JUL</td>
<td>Catholics in Cuba’s Revolution</td>
<td>Lecture/primary source (Cardenal, “Catholic Church and the Revolution”/“Pope John Paul II Speaks in Cuba”)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THU 11 JUL</td>
<td>Closing session</td>
<td>Final paper [political religions] due today! Class survey. If time permits, we may finish by watching the Cuban film El Bantizy.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Classroom Policies

Attendance. You are allowed up to three unexcused absences. Each additional unexcused absence will carry a 5% penalty, applied to the total course grade. If you arrive late, it is your responsibility at the end of class to ensure that you are marked as “present” for that day. For medical absences to be excused, a doctor’s statement/evidence is required. If you miss class, consult with me about catch-up procedures/materials for that day.

Late work. Please bring completed assignments to class on the due day. For work submitted late, there will be a penalty of one letter grade per day, up to a maximum of three days & including weekends. Work submitted more than three days late will be given a grade of zero. I do not accept work by email attachment, except by prior agreement.
Extensions will be granted only by agreement: they are exceptional, not guaranteed, especially for the final paper.

Email. I will try to answer reasonable email queries within a couple of days. Please check your email for course announcements.

Plagiarism. Plagiarism will result in an official report to the registrar and/or automatic failure of the course (see UT policy below).

Other syllabus information required by the Provost's Office:

Policy on Scholastic Dishonesty drafted by Student Judicial Services (SJS)
Students who violate University rules on scholastic dishonesty are subject to disciplinary penalties, including the possibility of failure in the course and/or dismissal from the University. Since such dishonesty harms the individual, all students, and the integrity of the University, policies on scholastic dishonesty will be strictly enforced. For further information please visit the Student Judicial Services website: http://deanofstudents.utexas.edu/sjs.

University of Texas Honor Code
The core values of The University of Texas at Austin are learning, discovery, freedom, leadership, individual opportunity, and responsibility. Each member of the university is expected to uphold these values through integrity, honesty, trust, fairness, and respect toward peers and community.

Use of E-Mail for Official Correspondence to Students
Email is recognized as an official mode of university correspondence; therefore, you are responsible for reading your email for university and course-related information and announcements. You are responsible to keep the university informed about changes to your e-mail address. You should check your e-mail regularly and frequently—at minimum twice a week—to stay current with university-related communications, some of which may be time-critical. You can find UT Austin’s policies and instructions for updating your e-mail address at http://www.utexas.edu/its/policies/emailnotify.php.

Documented Disability Statement
If you require special accommodations, you must obtain a letter that documents your disability from the Services for Students with Disabilities area of the Division of Diversity and Community Engagement (471-6259 voice or 471-4641 TTY for users who are deaf or hard of hearing). Present the letter to me at the beginning of the semester so we can discuss the accommodations you need. No later than five business days before an exam, you should remind me of any testing accommodations you will need. For more information, visit http://www.utexas.edu/diversity/ddce/ssd/.

Religious Holidays
By UT Austin policy, you must notify me of your pending absence at least fourteen days prior to the date of observance of a religious holy day. If you must miss a class, an examination, a work assignment, or a project in order to observe a religious holy day, I will give you an opportunity to complete the missed work within a reasonable time after the absence.

Behavior Concerns Advice Line (BCAL)
If you are worried about someone who is acting differently, you may use the Behavior Concerns Advice Line to discuss by phone your concerns about another individual’s behavior. This service is provided through a partnership among the Office of the Dean of Students, the Counseling and Mental Health Center (CMHC), the Employee Assistance Program (EAP), and The University of Texas Police Department (UTPD). Call 512-232-5050 or visit http://www.utexas.edu/safety/bcal.

Emergency Evacuation Policy
Occupants of buildings on the UT Austin campus are required to evacuate and assemble outside when a fire alarm is activated or an announcement is made. Please be aware of the following policies regarding evacuation:

- Familiarize yourself with all exit doors of the classroom and the building. Remember that the nearest exit door may not be the one you used when you entered the building.
- If you require assistance to evacuate, inform me in writing during the first week of class.
- In the event of an evacuation, follow my instructions or those of class instructors.
- Do not re-enter a building unless you’re given instructions by the Austin Fire Department, the UT Austin Police Department, or the Fire Prevention Services office.